

Developing Minds

A Resource Book for Teaching Thinking

3RD EDITION

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ix
PREFACE TO THE 3RD EDITION <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	x
FOREWORD <i>Ron Brandt</i>	xii
INTRODUCTION: THE VISION <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	xv
SECTION I. THE NEED TO TEACH THINKING	
INTRODUCTION <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	2
1. MAKING AMERICA SMARTER: THE REAL GOAL OF SCHOOL REFORM <i>Lauren B. Resnick</i>	3
2. THINKING SKILLS FOR THE INFORMATION AGE <i>LeRoy Hay</i>	7
3. THINKING IN CONTEXT: TEACHING FOR OPEN-MINDEDNESS AND CRITICAL UNDERSTANDING <i>Sheldon Berman</i>	11
4. FIVE HUMAN PASSIONS: THE ORIGINS OF EFFECTIVE THINKING <i>Arthur L. Costa and Robert J. Garmston</i>	18
5. LEARNING AND THINKING IN THE WORKPLACE <i>John Edwards</i>	23
6. STANDARDS-BASED THINKING AND REASONING SKILLS <i>Robert J. Marzano and Jane E. Pollock</i>	29
7. TEACHING THINKING SKILLS—DEFINING THE PROBLEM <i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	35
SECTION II. THINKING: BUILDING COMMON UNDERSTANDINGS	
INTRODUCTION <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	42
8. GOALS FOR A CRITICAL THINKING CURRICULUM AND ITS ASSESSMENT <i>Robert H. Ennis</i>	44
9. THINKING SKILLS: MEANINGS AND MODELS REVISITED <i>Barbara Z. Presseisen</i>	47
10. WHAT IS PROBLEM SOLVING? <i>Jack Lochhead and Aletta Zietsman</i>	54
11. THINKING ABOUT DECISIONS <i>Robert J. Swartz</i>	58
12. CREATIVE THINKING: AN ESSENTIAL LIFE SKILL <i>Gerard J. Puccio and Mary C. Murdock</i>	67
13. ADDED VALUE: A DISPOSITIONAL PERSPECTIVE ON THINKING <i>Shari Tishman</i>	72
14. ACTIVELY OPEN-MINDED THINKING <i>Jonathan Baron</i>	76
15. HABITS OF MIND <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	80
16. WHAT PHILOSOPHY OFFERS TO THE TEACHING OF THINKING <i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	87

SECTION III.	CREATING THOUGHT-FULL ENVIRONMENTS	
	INTRODUCTION <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	94
	17. CAPITALIZING ON THE INVISIBLE DIMENSION OF ORGANIZATIONAL LEARNING <i>Geoffrey Caine and Renate Nummela Caine</i>	96
	18. THOUGHTFUL PARENTING <i>Dee Dickinson</i>	101
	19. DESIGNING THE INVITATIONAL ENVIRONMENT <i>John Barell</i>	106
	20. PREPARING TEACHERS OF THINKING <i>David S. Martin and Nicholas M. Michelli</i>	111
	21. FROM STAFF DEVELOPMENT TO PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT: SUPPORTING THOUGHTFUL ADULTS FOR THINKING SCHOOLS <i>Laura Lipton and Bruce Wellman</i>	118
	22. FOR ADMINISTRATORS: KEEPING THE FOCUS <i>David S. Martin</i>	123
	23. BUILDING A THOUGHTFUL HIGH SCHOOL <i>William C. Martin</i>	126
	24. MANAGING FOR REFLECTION: A SUPERINTENDENT'S DILEMMA <i>Sherry P. King</i>	131
	25. MEDIATIVE ENVIRONMENTS <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	135
SECTION IV.	OUR CHANGING PERSPECTIVES ON THINKING	
	INTRODUCTION <i>Robin Fogarty</i>	142
	26. OUR CHANGING PERSPECTIVE OF INTELLIGENCE: MASTER ARCHITECTS OF THE INTELLECT <i>Robin Fogarty</i>	144
	27. BECOMING A CONSTRUCTIVIST TEACHER <i>Jacqueline Grennon Brooks and Martin G. Brooks</i>	150
	28. THE SOCIAL SIDE OF THINKING <i>David Perkins</i>	158
	29. IN THE GRIPS OF EMOTION <i>Robert J. Swartz</i>	164
	30. ON TEACHING BRAINS TO THINK: A CONVERSATION WITH ROBERT SYLWESTER <i>Ron Brandt</i>	170
	31. THE BIOLOGICAL BASIS FOR THINKING <i>Lawrence F. Lowery</i>	175
	32. A NEW TAXONOMY OF EDUCATIONAL OBJECTIVES <i>Robert J. Marzano</i>	181
SECTION V.	HUMAN VARIABILITY AND THINKING	
	INTRODUCTION <i>Sandra Parks</i>	190
	33. A SURVEY OF THINKING AND LEARNING STYLES <i>Armando Lozano</i>	192
	34. THINKING STYLES <i>Robert J. Sternberg</i>	197
	35. TEACHING FOR, WITH, AND ABOUT MULTIPLE INTELLIGENCES <i>David G. Lazear</i>	202
	36. THINKING AND THE SPECIAL-NEEDS LEARNER <i>David S. Martin</i>	211
	37. CULTURAL INFLUENCES ON CRITICAL THINKING AND PROBLEM SOLVING <i>Douglas F. Brenner and Sandra Parks</i>	216
	38. REVERSING UNDERACHIEVEMENT IN URBAN STUDENTS: PEDAGOGY OF CONFIDENCE <i>Yvette Jackson</i>	222
	39. THINKING IN A CULTURE OF POVERTY <i>Ruby K. Payne</i>	229
	40. THE BIOLOGICAL BASIS FOR LEARNING <i>Lawrence F. Lowery</i>	234
SECTION VI.	THINKING ACROSS THE CURRICULUM	
	INTRODUCTION <i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	246
	41. DEVELOPING A SCOPE AND SEQUENCE FOR THINKING SKILLS INSTRUCTION <i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	248

42. TEACHER AS “THOUGHT-FULL” DESIGNER	<i>Bena Kallick and Marian Leibowitz</i>	253
43. BIG ROCKS AND POWERFUL KINGDOMS: PROBLEM-BASED LEARNING IN SCIENCE AND SOCIAL STUDIES	<i>John Barell, Cheryl Hopper, and Ann White</i>	256
44. RESETTING THE TABLE: A BALANCED DIET OF THOUGHT-FILLED INTEGRATION	<i>Burton Cohen and Peter Hiltz</i>	262
45. INFUSING CRITICAL AND CREATIVE THINKING INTO CONTENT INSTRUCTION	<i>Robert J. Swartz</i>	266
46. WHAT RESEARCH SAYS ABOUT TEACHING THINKING SKILLS	<i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	275
SECTION VII. THINKING IN SCHOOL SUBJECTS		
INTRODUCTION	<i>John Barell</i>	284
47. MATHEMATICS: THE THINKING ARENA FOR PROBLEM SOLVING	<i>Marcy Cook</i>	286
48. IMPROVING THINKING ABILITIES THROUGH READING INSTRUCTION	<i>Cathy Collins Block</i>	292
49. WHAT IS WRITE FOR THINKING?	<i>Arthur Whimbey, Jack Lochhead, Myra J. Linden, and Carol Welsh</i>	298
50. TEACHING THINKING IN SCIENCE	<i>Robert J. Swartz and Stephen David Fischer</i>	303
51. THE ROLE OF THE ARTS IN COGNITION AND CURRICULUM	<i>Elliot W. Eisner</i>	310
52. INFUSING THINKING IN HISTORY AND THE SOCIAL SCIENCES	<i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	317
53. A VIEW FROM THE FOXHOLE: ELEVATING FOREIGN LANGUAGE CLASSROOMS	<i>Virginia Pauline Rojas</i>	326
54. MUSIC AND SKILLFUL THINKING	<i>Ruth M. Loring</i>	332
55. DEVELOPING A LIFETIME OF LITERACY	<i>Rebecca Reagan</i>	337
56. DEVELOPING THINKING SKILLS IN PHYSICAL EDUCATION	<i>Daniel M. Landers, William Maxwell, Jessica Butler, and Lex Fagen</i>	343
SECTION VIII. TECHNIQUES FOR TEACHING THINKING		
INTRODUCTION	<i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	352
57. TEACHING FOR, OF, AND ABOUT THINKING	<i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	354
58. TEACHER BEHAVIORS THAT ENABLE STUDENT THINKING	<i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	359
59. TEACHING FOR TRANSFER	<i>David Perkins and Gavriel Salomon</i>	370
60. TEACHING THE LANGUAGE OF THINKING	<i>Arthur L. Costa and Robert J. Marzano</i>	379
61. CUEING THINKING IN THE CLASSROOM: THE PROMISE OF THEORY-EMBEDDED TOOLS	<i>Jay McTighe and Frank T. Lyman Jr.</i>	384
62. PRACTICAL STRATEGIES FOR DIRECT INSTRUCTION IN THINKING SKILLS	<i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	393
63. VISUAL TOOLS FOR MAPPING MINDS	<i>David Hyerle</i>	401
64. MEDIATING THE METACOGNITIVE	<i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	408
65. MAKING SENSE OF THINKING	<i>Jack Lochhead</i>	413
66. PUTTING IT ALL TOGETHER TO IMPROVE STUDENT THINKING	<i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	417
SECTION IX. STRATEGIES FOR TEACHING THINKING		
INTRODUCTION	<i>Jack Lochhead</i>	426
67. DIALOGICAL AND DIALECTICAL THINKING	<i>Richard W. Paul</i>	427

68. CONCEPT DEVELOPMENT	<i>Sydelle Seiger-Ehrenberg</i>	437
69. TEACHING FOR CREATIVE LEARNING AND PROBLEM SOLVING	<i>Donald J. Treffinger and Scott G. Isaksen</i>	442
70. THINKING FOR UNDERSTANDING	<i>David Perkins</i>	446
71. TEACHING PROBLEM SOLVING AS A WAY OF LIFE	<i>Robert J. Sternberg</i>	451
72. COOPERATION AND CONFLICT: EFFECTS ON COGNITION AND METACOGNITION	<i>David W. Johnson and Roger T. Johnson</i>	455
73. THE ART AND CRAFT OF “GENTLY SOCRATIC” INQUIRY	<i>Thomas E. Jackson</i>	459
74. TEACHING COGNITIVE STRATEGIES FOR READING, WRITING, AND PROBLEM SOLVING	<i>Michael Pressley and Karen R. Harris</i>	466
SECTION X. TEACHING THINKING THROUGH TECHNOLOGY		
INTRODUCTION	<i>Bena Kallick</i>	472
75. TECHNOLOGY AND THINKING: THE EVOLVING RELATIONSHIP	<i>James M. Wilson III</i>	474
76. THINKING IN THE INFORMATION AGE	<i>Gary R. Morrison and Deborah L. Lowther</i>	479
77. LEARNING IN A DIGITAL WORLD	<i>John Richards</i>	484
78. INTEGRATING RESEARCH, THINKING, AND TECHNOLOGY	<i>Joanne Marien, Elaine Vislocky, and Linda Chapman</i>	489
SECTION XI. ASSESSING GROWTH IN THINKING ABILITIES		
INTRODUCTION	<i>Bena Kallick</i>	496
79. TO THINK OR NOT TO THINK: THINKING AS MEASURED ON STATE AND NATIONAL ASSESSMENTS	<i>Elliott Asp</i>	497
80. STATE EXAMS FLUNK TEST OF QUALITY THINKING	<i>Monty Neill</i>	511
81. BUILDING A SYSTEM FOR ASSESSING THINKING	<i>Arthur L. Costa and Bena Kallick</i>	517
82. HOW TEACHERS CAN ASSESS THE THINKING SKILLS THEY ARE TEACHING	<i>Robert Stone</i>	525
83. PERFORMANCES TO ASSESS STANDARDS AND INTELLECTUAL GROWTH	<i>Kay Burke</i>	528
84. A FORMAT FOR ASSESSING THINKING SKILLS	<i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	533
85. ASSESSING THINKING SKILLS	<i>Alec Fisher</i>	541
APPENDIXES AND RESOURCES		
INTRODUCTION	<i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	547
GLOSSARY OF THINKING TERMS	<i>Barry K. Beyer, Arthur L. Costa, and Barbara Z. Presseisen</i>	548
APPENDIX A: SELF-REFLECTION ON OUR OWN MODELS OF TEACHING	<i>John Barell</i>	551
APPENDIX B: CLASSROOM OBSERVATION CHECKLIST	<i>Lee Winocur Field</i>	552
APPENDIX C: HOW THOUGHTFUL IS YOUR SCHOOL?	<i>Arthur L. Costa</i>	555
APPENDIX D: CHECKLIST FOR THINKING SKILLS PROGRAMS	<i>Barry K. Beyer</i>	556
RECOMMENDED RESOURCES		558
ABOUT THE AUTHORS		564
INDEX TO AUTHORS		579
INDEX		580

Foreword

RON BRANDT

Who can say when and how it began? Long before our own day, educators sought to teach their students to think. Philosopher John Dewey first published his analysis titled *How We Think* in 1910, and a substantial movement devoted to critical thinking flourished in the 1960s. For me, though, the current thinking skills movement began in 1981, when I edited an issue of ASCD's *Educational Leadership* magazine called "Teaching Thinking Skills." Something was in the wind. I wasn't entirely sure what, but it was very exciting.

Cognitive psychology had displaced behaviorism, with its limited approach to mental activity. Mathematics and science educators were stressing problem solving. Critical thinking was making a comeback, especially on college campuses. Several instructional programs had been developed to improve students' thinking, which some equated with intelligence. A major factor helping to consolidate these efforts was a project that had been launched in Venezuela in 1978, led by national minister Luis Machado, to make all that country's citizens more intelligent (Perkins, 1995). Project Intelligence, as it was called, not only was using existing programs, such as Edward de Bono's CoRT thinking program, but also had commissioned the creation of a second generation curriculum, later to be published in the United States as *Odyssey*.

In the early 1980s most experts claimed (and some still do) that intelligence is unalterable. People are born with a certain level of intellectual ability, the IQ tests seemed to show, and you can't do much about it. At that time researchers such as Howard Gardner and Robert Sternberg were just beginning to explore expanded definitions of intellectual ability, and though true believers were convinced, the evidence was pretty skimpy that—using the title of a book published in 1976—*Intelligence Can Be Taught* (Whimbey, A., & Whimbey, L. S.).

One of the authors in that early issue of *Educational Leadership* was Arthur Costa, then a professor at California State University, Sacramento, and a member of ASCD's Executive Council. In his article, Art neatly dodged the question of

whether schools could change measured intelligence. Instead, he focused on intelligent behavior, which surely they could influence. Art Costa continued to play key roles in the development of ASCD's program. In the summer of 1983, he and I organized an institute on thinking skills, introducing participants to programs such as Reuven Feuerstein's Instrumental Enrichment. The following year we held an invitational conference at the Wingspread center in Racine, Wisconsin, to plan a more comprehensive set of activities. The conference produced several recommendations, including a suggestion that ASCD publish a "resource book." I wasn't sure what such a book would be, but I invited Art to serve as editor, and he generously agreed. The result was the first edition of *Developing Minds*, which at the time was the largest book ASCD had published and which also has become one of the most successful and influential.

BASIC ISSUES

The thinking skills movement examined in this volume has been bedeviled by at least three questions. The first is "What skills are you talking about?" The next, quite naturally, is "Can such skills be taught?" When that question is answered by citing examples of apparent success, usually achieved under relatively controlled conditions, the third question becomes "Should (can) thinking be taught not as a separate curriculum but in regular classes in conjunction with teaching subject matter?"

Before briefly discussing these questions, I will address the many possible meanings of "teaching thinking." Arthur Costa and I sometimes divide the field into three categories: teaching for thinking, teaching about thinking, and teaching of thinking. Even these categories mean different things to different people.

Here is what I mean by them. Teaching of thinking is what program developers like Matthew Lipman, creator of the Philosophy for Children program, have learned to do, using teach-